



# ***Environmental Advisory Board***

## **Meeting Agenda**

December 18, 2024 3:00 P.M.

Centennial II HR Conference Room A

805 Central Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Virtual Attendance through Microsoft Teams

### **Order of Business**

- I. Public Comment**
- II. Call to Order**
- III. Administrative Action\***
  - Approval of November 20, 2024 – Meeting minutes
- IV. Office of Environment and Sustainability Comments**
  
- V. Information/Updates**
  - 2025 Schedule, Board Members, Elections
  - Update on EAB presentation to CEI Committee & meeting with Councilmember Owens
  
- VI. Items for Vote\***
  
- VII. Presentations**
  
- VIII. Open Discussion**
  - Comments on Actions with Policy Focus:
    - i. Building Performance
    - ii. Codifying Environmental Justice
    - iii. Green Infrastructure
  
- IX. Next Meeting**
  - The next EAB meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, January 29, 2025 at 3:00 PM.
- X. Adjournment**

*\*Board Action Requested*

### **Agenda Packet Materials:**

- Draft meeting minutes from 11/20/24
- GCP Action List with Policy Focus - Updated

# Environmental Advisory Board

## Minutes of November 20, 2024

### Members Present:

- **In person:** Andrew Musgrave; Ashlee Young; Kylie Johnson; Susan Sprigg; Van Sullivan
- **Virtual:** Dave Schmitt; Julie Shifman; Nathan Alley; Rico Blackman

**Members Absent:** Chad Day; Diana Hodge; Erika Copeland; Tanner Yess

**Staff Present:** Amanda Testerman; Erin Kabel

**Meeting:** A meeting of the Environmental Advisory Board was held on November 20, 2024 at 3:00 PM at Centennial II HR Conference Room A, 805 Central Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio 45202.

### Meeting Agenda:

- I. **Public Comment**
- II. **Call to Order at 3:05 PM**
- III. **Administrative Action\***
  - Approval of October 30, 2024 – Meeting minutes
- IV. **Office of Environment and Sustainability Comments**
- V. **Information/Updates**
  - Outlook after 2024 Election Results
  - EAB Board 2025 Membership Updates & Intentions – Erin Kabel from OES contacted all board members to inform them of their board term, requesting an update on their membership intentions for 2025. This will help us understand which board members want to continue in their term and how many positions need to be filled for next year.
  - Update on EAB Presentation to Climate, Environment, and Infrastructure (CEI) Committee – scheduled for December 3<sup>rd</sup> at 10 AM in Council Chambers. This meeting is open to the public and will be streamed on Citi Cable.
- VI. **Items for Vote\***
  - January and February 2025 Meeting Schedule – per attachment 1
    - Board members voted to accept the proposed meeting schedule for January and February 2025, as seen in attachment 2: Yes – 9 votes; No – 0 votes [PASSES]
  - Bylaw amendment for Board Member Attendance requirements
    - Motion to approve bylaw amendment to add language to Article II, section F: "Every member of the Board is expected to attend a minimum of two-thirds of the meetings of the Board in any calendar year. Any member who fails to meet this minimum requirement will be presumed to have resigned. The Secretary will provide notice to the board member after three absences notifying them of their attendance status." Yes – 8 votes; No – 1 vote [FAILS]
    - Motion to approve bylaw amendment to add language to Article II, section F: "Every member of the Board is expected to attend a minimum of two-thirds of the meetings of the Board in any calendar year. Any member who fails to meet this minimum requirement will be presumed to have resigned. The Secretary will provide notice to the board member after two absences notifying them of their attendance status." Yes – 9 votes; No – 0 votes [PASSES]
- VII. **Presentations**
  - Hillside Trust – Eric Russo: Hillside Trust is a land conservancy organization which protects Hillside in the Cincinnati region – they have 135 acres. The forestry assessment which requires a fee to be paid for land owners based on the feet the property borders along right of way has impacted their

ability to conserve land and maintain these fees. In the past the fees were \$4300 or \$5000 for 2023. In 2024 they anticipate the cost being closer to \$10,000. They have been trying to meet this increased cost with stewardship gifts.

- Hillside Trust has met with Councilmember Owens' office and is requesting that the forestry assessment be abated for environmental or land conservancy groups.

**VIII. Open Discussion**

- Environment & Sustainability Committees: Board members have discussed GCP priority actions for policy recommendations. The upcoming December and January meetings will be used to further discuss and determine deliverables for the group. Board members requested that they discuss this as a whole, instead of dividing into break-out groups so everyone can be engaged in both committees.

**I. Next Meeting**

- Wednesday, December 18, 2024 at 3:00 PM

**II. Adjournment at 4:35 PM**

DRAFT

## GCP Actions with Policy Aspects

Focus Area	Action #	Action	Status	Status Description	EAB Policy Focus
Buildings & Energy	B&E.1	Improve building performance by implementing policies like benchmarking, building performance standards, or other relevant energy standards	In progress	The City is working with UC professor Amanda Webb and other Ohio cities on a BPS focused grant that started in January 2024. The grant is currently in the research phase and will begin outreach later this year. The City submitted a grant application with the same partners to fund implementation of BPS. Benchmarking report provided to council.	Yes
Buildings & Energy	B&E.3	Recognize the role embodied carbon plays in the built environment and align incentive programs to encourage the reuse of existing buildings	Suggested	No action to date.	Yes
Buildings & Energy	B&E.5	Create incentives to encourage developers to electrify new buildings or install infrastructure so buildings can easily convert to all-electric in the future	Suggested	No action to date. Federal incentives will help. Attempted to get it included in the Residential Tax Abatement Program. Commercial Tax Abatement will be up for review this year, so opportunity is on the horizon.	Yes
Buildings & Energy	B&E.9	Create policies that will increase the energy efficiency of residential single and multi-family buildings in order to decrease energy poverty	In progress	The BPS grant with UC professor Amanda Webb will look at standards for multifamily housing. There are no discussions surrounding single family homes.	Yes
City Operations	CO.6	Create policy for the procurement of sustainable goods for internal City supplies and materials informed by a city audit to develop strategic priorities	Suggested	Sustainable Fleet Policy is a working model with many challenges. Conversations happening around similar approach for Facilities.	Yes
City Operations	CO.18	Organize facility managers to create a sustainable facility policy for new city buildings	Suggested	Discussions with Facilities about approach. Revolving Loan Fund + IRA could be great impetus for formalized policy.	Yes
Community Activation	CA.2	Build and present a case for long-term funding mechanisms that drive emissions reductions. Reallocate the resources generated to reduce disparate impacts.	Suggested	<b>Legal opinion offered that allows for fees for recycling and trash carts - mechanisms still TBD; Potential Green Cincinnati fee connected to the earnings tax discussion folling the Futures Report;</b> Offered to UC environmental capstone students as a thesis option; revolving loan fund and greenbank efforts could help influence; potential Charter amendment for waste fees; Councilmembers discussing climate fee; EAB could play role	Yes
Community Activation	CA.3	Support codification of climate justice and racial equity in City decision-making mechanisms	In progress	<b>Office of Equity possibility still in conversation;</b> Rail sale Rising 15 request for report; Council recommendation was made around using the GCP like Plan Cincinnati as policies, programs, and purchases are screened - no known formal action on this to date - talks underway with Budget, Law, etc. but skepticism; GARE membership and early stage work underway	Yes
Food	F.9	<a href="#">Implement the Milan Urban Food Policy Pact related to good governance, sustainable diets &amp; nutrition, social &amp; economic equity, food production, food supply &amp; distribution and food waste</a>	In progress	Brick Gardens is playing in all spaces; sustainable diets and nutrition and social & economic equity are probably focus; Food Waste Piece: CO- composting program at Camp Washington and beyond; Collaboration model? Interstate with Rust Belt; Continuing of look at network and what work is being done; developing network of FW reclamation; Support compst Production across many sites; continue making compost at Camp; Bioreactors; Hamilton CO county working related to Food Waste; NRDC suggesting potential policy changes	Yes
Mobility	M.7	Develop policies to ensure that vehicle charging infrastructure is available to all residents including those who live in multi-family buildings and in homes without driveways	In progress	Worked with Planning and one of their interns to evaluate updates to City code that will reflect need for EV charging. Zoning administrator was in the conversations and it has traction. Leveraging EV charging vendor and grants to bring chargers to neighborhoods that need them.	Yes
Mobility	M.9	Develop policies and incentives to ensure new construction is prepared for EV charging	In progress	Worked with Planning and one of their interns to evaluate updates to City code that will reflect need for EV charging. Zoning administrator was in the conversations and it has traction.	Yes
Mobility	M.10	Continue to invest in complete streets to improve connectivity between neighborhoods	In progress	City passed a Complete Streets ordinance in November 2022. DOTE currently examining using Complete Streets principles to transform Central Parkway. Currently in final design and engineering.	Yes
Mobility	M.16	Embrace zoning reform that increases density near transit, reduces or eliminates parking requirements across the city, and minimizes the use of surface parking lots	Completed	Connected Communities passed in June of 2024. Council addressed surface parking lots in CBD.	Yes
Natural Environment	NE.4	Implement policies that protect existing trees during development efforts	Suggested	Report by Sam Gielink on options from other municipalities, example ordinances complete. Potential option for EAB to provide suggestions to committee. Some interest from EAB to further explore these options, likely in 2025.  Motion #202302795 passed by Council in December requesting: "the Administration supplement its process for granting easements to third parties. This supplement should include (but not limited to): detailed guidelines for community engagement and communication for easements authorizing large-scale construction or earth movement with the potential to impact neighbors, and restoration and replacement of removal of trees and vegetation."	Yes
Natural Environment	NE.8	Strengthen air emissions regulations	Suggested	XU intern project focused on study of municipal air regulations with comparison to see what action municipalities have taken determined there are limited actions US Cities have successfully taken. Most examples are from other countries with poorer air quality. Ohio EPA released a draft of the "Second 10-Year Maintenance Plan for the Ohio Portion of the Cincinnati, OH-KY-IN 8-Hour Ozone Maintenance Area" - this plan shows that Hamilton county is projected to meet the maintenance requirements, but only because of the projected emission decreases for on-road/mobile sources. Otherwise they have a projected increase in area VOCs and NOx emissions. On/road mobile source data came from OKI. NY using building performance focused on GHG emissions-energy use. This is separate from air permitting requirements.	Yes

## GCP Actions with Policy Aspects

Focus Area	Action #	Action	Status	Status Description	EAB Policy Focus
Natural Environment	NE.13	Implement policies which promote and protect public greenspaces in new developments	Suggested	Some interest from EAB to further explore these options, likely in 2025.	Yes
Natural Environment	NE.15	Implement policies that restrict development in forested and/or biodiverse areas	Suggested	Report by Xavier intern on options from other municipalities, example ordinances complete. Potential option for EAB to provide suggestions to committee. Some interest from EAB to further explore these options, likely in 2025.	Yes
Resilience & Climate Adaptation	R.1	Incentivize green infrastructure projects in communities with extreme heat and flood vulnerabilities	In progress	KCB includes green infrastructure elements in all of their greenspaces OES created 1-pager and infographic on updated website. FUSE climate resilience project included aspects of this action including listening tour, landscape analysis, and grant support. Relationship building: MSD, SMU, MCA, Parks, OKI, Hamilton County Conservation District, and many others highlighted in FUSE listening tour report.	Yes
Resilience & Climate Adaptation	R.8	Continue to implement affordable and mixed-income housing strategies to stabilize communities	In progress	Connected Communities Zoning Reform Ordinance Passed 6/5/2024. Continue supporting repurposing of industrial and commercial office space to residential land use including through brownfield redevelopment. This is being funded in part through state and federal brownfield grants, tax credits, tax incentive financing, opportunity zones. Continued to foster relationship with orgs including CMHA, the Port, and DCED among others. Studies recently completed applicable to this action include the City's Financial Blueprint and the City's Futures Commission Report, both of which include more detailed recommended actions. Cincinnati formally awarded Bloomberg American Sustainable Cities initiative funding in March 2024 to support a three member i-team to work with the mayor's office to address financial and climate racial inequities including a focus on affordable housing. Their work began in September 2024.	Yes
Resilience & Climate Adaptation	R.14	Protect landslide-prone hillsides and overland flood risk zones through land development policies, such as Low Impact Development	In progress	FEMA BRIC TA grant submitted to address landslide area in Beekman Corridor - not awarded. FEMA BRIC PROTECT Grant for \$10 Million - awarded to DOTE. Grant project includes stabilization of 10 landslide prone areas in the City. Action item landscape analysis of existing city land development policies as administered by DOTE and B&I. City council report from DOTE & B&I on landslide in progress work (assessing, investigating, remediating, started, progress, completed).	Yes
Zero Waste	ZW.1	Increase the number of multi-family dwellings with recycling infrastructure	In progress	Multi-family recycling pilot finished at Tudor Court. White paper report prepared. Application for funding through The Recycling Partnership (TRP) was submitted 2/28/24 and revised 3/13/24. Verbal approval received. MOU to be drafted in near term. Anticipated to start January 2025. Researching other leads for multi-family pilots with Hamilton County. Clifton Manor identified as a probably next pilot location. Also, evaluating interior bin placement at UC to increase dorm use of existing recycling dumpsters. Submitted Recycle Ohio Grant on 12/5/2024 to do a 2-4 unit multi-family building interior bin campaign.	Yes
Zero Waste	ZW.3	Require permitted public events and events held on City property use best available recycling practices and include recycling service costs in the permit fee	In progress	Special event mapping technology from the Recycle Hack-a-thon is being explored by OPDA; Hamilton County provides infrastructure (bins) and the Chamber is in support of this; Special event recycling is included as a component of the recycling services new contract with Rumpke that is currently under negotiation.	Yes
Zero Waste	ZW.8	Incentivize recycling and diversion innovation by increasing the cost of waste generation and disposal	In progress	Imposing a fee for trash is currently prohibited by the Cincinnati Garbage Fee Charter Amendment passed in 2011. Policy changes would be needed to implement Pay as You Throw (PAYT) or volume-based waste fees. PAYT report developed by OES Intern. NRDC may be able to provide technical assistance for policy language and development. Administration is currently exploring options to create a revenue stream within the bounds of the charter amendment - cart rental fee is potentially feasible and allowable.	Yes
Zero Waste	ZW.14	Support funding, siting, and development of a local, large-scale Class II compost facility	In progress	The Hamilton County Solid Waste Policy committee completed a study to determine a location and best type of facility that will be needed. Results show that two to three mid-sized aerated static pile facilities is optimal. County plans to submit an EPA SWIFR grant on 12/20/2024 to request funding site development of one aerated static pile facility. CPRG Implementation Grant submittal that included a funding request to fund a composting facility was not awarded.	yes
Zero Waste	ZW.17	Utilize policy and fees to discourage the use of single-use plastics including plastic bags	In progress	Ohio House Bill 242 prevents Cities from implementing fees for single-use plastics. OES intern prepared a report on actions other Ohio municipalities are taking. OES is in very early stages of evaluating the municipal feasibility of Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) regulations for plastics such as a bottle deposit program.	yes
Zero Waste	ZW.18	Reduce litter and illegal dumping through public communications strategy and stronger enforcement	In progress	OES purchased 48 recycling containers (corner cans) for DORA Districts to assist with litter reduction; Additional 25 containers in CBD installed to reduce litter; OES planning to purchase another 100 recycling containers for DORA and neighborhood business districts; OES evaluating funding KCB's Don't Dump the Nati program for 2025 (program decreased illegal dumping by 30% in 2024); Council approved ordinance 729-31 on 11/15/23 allowing the city to impound a vehicle used to illegally dump trash. Two other ordinances aimed at reducing litter were also approved: Fencing vacant lots and AMENDING Section 729-7, "Setting Out Containers," to ensure the clean and safe storage of garbage containers and dumpsters	Yes