

**Manager's Advisory Group - Quarterly Meeting
August 29, 2019
Public Services, Administration Building**

Present:

Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager
Eliot Isaac, Police Chief
Michelle Bonner, Citizen Complaint Authority (Substituting for Kim Neal)
Jason Cooper, Division Manager – Criminal Justice Initiatives
Lt. Elena Moton, Cincinnati Police Department
Bridget Patton, Mayor's Office
Perriann Allen, Law and Public Safety Committee (VM Smitherman's Office)
Elizabeth Bartley, Invest in Neighborhoods
Pastor Jonathan Brown, Pilgrim Missionary Baptist Church
Margaret Fox, Metropolitan Area Religious Coalition of Cincinnati
Rachel Hastings, Price Hill Will
Iris Roley, Cincinnati Black United Front
Dr. Ebony Ruhland, University of Cincinnati School of Criminal Justice
Rickell Howard Smith, JD, Greater Cincinnati Foundation

Mutual Accountability Q & A

City Manager Duhaney convened the meeting and asked the members if there were any questions related to the meeting materials sent out in advance, or any events or activity since the May MAG meeting. In lieu of questions, Division Manager Cooper provided an update on action items from the last MAG meeting related to improving CPD's tracking of outcomes and location for traffic and pedestrian stops (See Appendix A).

Ms. Roley asked the administration to provide some background and context for the contact card. The card was implemented as an outcome of the Collaborative Agreement and an electronic version will be implemented by the end of the year. Chief Isaac explained the contact card is one of many tools that allow CPD command staff to use data to analyze officers' performance and/or problematic patterns with traffic and pedestrian stops and complaints. Pastor Brown questioned what happens if the officer does not include some disposition. Chief Isaac stated that all officers are required to complete the card. He emphasized the data derived from the cards leaves a small margin for error. Lt. Moton assured the group that CPD will provide more training for the officers to use the new electronic contact card, while also an emphasis on improving the recording of racial and demographic info during stops.

A comment was made about the safety of children walking to and from school. Chief Isaac shared that CPD is increasing pedestrian enforcement near and around all school zones.

Division Manager Cooper highlighted a new addition to the Collaborative Agreement Performance Deck, a city-wide performance overview that provides a quick snapshot of City-Wide performance indicators. Iris Roley asked and wanted to know how to compare the tables to see what's happening in order to get a clear analysis. Mr. Cooper shared that data by police district is still available under the appropriate goal. One member raised a concern that police districts are not monolithic and often contain several

diverse communities with varied outcomes that are not reflected in aggregate for the district. Mr. Cooper added that additional info can be gathered utilizing the City's open data portal and Cincy insights to gain insight at the neighborhood level. Both tools open to the public.

Dr. Ruhland suggested adding data that reflects migration patterns in the neighborhoods. Other members talked about adding footnotes, traffic benchmarks, baseline movement patterns with statistical background, and impact. As a result, Mr. Cooper requested suggestions to make the report better.

Ms. Howard-Smith asked a question about performance measures to be used for comparison and evaluation. Chief Isaac shared that is something CPD would like to explore further. Mr. Cooper highlighted that the City Manager's Office decided to add performance measures as a focus areas for year 2 of implementation, and to use year 1 to ensure our data collection, analysis and reporting mechanisms are working effectively (i.e. data sharing, collection and reporting) as recommended by Mr. Green and his team. Once we have that in place, the goal is to then use both quantitative and qualitative data to establish recommendations for performance measurement baselines with the help of the MAG.

Discussion Items

What is the current legal (or non-legal) binding of the Collaborative Agreement (CA)?

City Manager Duhaney clarified that the settlement agreement known as the Collaborative Agreement came to an end in 2008, and there is no legal or binding agreement between the City, the court and any party. The CA helped reduce crime while also paving the way for a series of reforms to CPD policies and procedures ranging from officer training, to protocol for use of force, to the creation of the Citizens Complaint Authority. He believed the City is better because of the CA, and the City is committed to working with key stakeholders in the community to address the findings and recommendations of the Collaborative Refresh.

What are the expectations for participation and partnership amongst the parties?

City Manager Duhaney shared that all participants of the MAG volunteer to participate and or be a partner. A few members expressed concerns that some partners are not working together. They observed that the FOP and the Black United Front are not working collaboratively. The City would like for both CBUF and FOP to stay at the table. Members suggested inviting other groups such as the Sentinel Police Association and the NAACP to the MAG to get their viewpoints. Another member mentioned that Saul Green agreed to help.

Mr. Cooper added that outside of the MAG, the City Manager's Office routinely engages and continues to build relationships with other community leaders and organizations on issues related to the Collaborative Refresh such as the Sentinels, Faith Community Alliance, Children's Law Center, etc. The City has had more success with some organizations than others in their willingness to engage.

The members discussed at length bridging the relationships with various groups including the FOP and Dan Hils. Some raised grave concerns about the FOP. The members who attended the meeting learned that most police officers including the African American officers belonged to the FOP. Chief Isaac acknowledged their concerns. In detail, he explained his role as chief of police. He explained that the

FOP does not direct the activities of the Police Department. As chief, he clarified that he is the one who makes Department procedures and provide direction for the Police Department. Pastor Brown thanked the Chief for clarifying his role and the role of the FOP.

What is the role of the MAG when there is an officer-involved shooting?

The City Manager explained that primarily, the role of the MAG during police-involved shootings is to help serve as ambassadors to disseminate information, to their networks and to help ensure continued transparency, fairness, and accountability to the City and the Police Department by asking questions.

What are the goals of the MAG and how do we measure success?

The City Manager listed the following goals of the MAG.

- Monitor the sustainability of the goals and principles related to the collaborative agreement, in addition to the implementation of the recommendations and findings from the Collaborative Refresh.
- Continue and further the dialogue about public safety and how policing is conducted across communities.

Iris Roley asked the Chief about a few teenage incidents in the city and one of them at Woodward High School. The Chief discussed the incident at Woodward High School and the related legal issues.

Meeting adjourned

Appendix A: MAG Update: CPD Data Collection

Update: Improving the tracking of Traffic and Pedestrian Stop Outcomes

Problem: At the May 2019 MAG meeting, the group discussed the high number of incidents where the outcome was “Not Provided”. The City agreed to explore and report back to the MAG. *Reference: Pages 21 & 24 of the Q2 2019 Performance Deck*

Analysis: Discussion surrounding possible missing options for outcomes concluded that juvenile referral information is captured on a Notice to Appear (NTA) as opposed to a Field Interview Report (FIR). CPD is exploring all available options such as combining the FIR and NTA for juveniles however this data is already captured.

Response:

- On electronic contact cards, the “Action Taken” field will become mandatory starting 9/1/19;
- CPD will assess the contact cards entered to date for missing information in that specific field, and then take any corrective measures needed, if necessary, which includes adding any missing categories according to solicited PO feedback;
- Electronic contact cards will be department wide in Fall 2019. The pilot has been successful in District 4 and will now be expanded to District 5 starting the week of 9/5.

Update: Improving the tracking of Traffic and Pedestrian Stop Locations by Police District

Problem: At the May 2019 MAG meeting, a concern was raised about the high number of traffic and pedestrian stops where the police district is not known. The City agreed to explore and report back to the MAG. *Reference: Pages 19, 20 and 21 of the Q2 2019 Performance Deck*

Analysis: Discussions with CPD and OPDA identified that the high number of stops where the police district is not known is due largely to geocoding issues on the software backend, particularly for incidents where the physical location is an intersection or highway location.

Response: CPD is working to address geocoding issues between the identification of police districts and incidents that occur at locations such as intersections. Although we are experiencing some issues with geocoding police districts (see red column below), CPD neighborhoods are available as a filter (see green column below) for further public analysis via the City’s Open Data Portal.

		ACTIONTAKEN	VEHICLE_MAKE	VEHICLE_YEAR	LICENSE_PLATE_ST	SEX	RACE	AGE_RA_NGE_C	BEAT	COMMUNITY_COUN_CIL_NEIGHBORHOOD	SNA_NEIGHBORHOOD	CPD_NEIGHBORHOOD	DISTRICT
5608	FULTON AV / EDEN PARK DR	ARREST CAPIASWAR	BMW	1998	OHIO	MALE	BLACK	36-45	P111	WALNUT HILLS	WALNUT HILLS	MOUNT ADAMS	
5609	EB W 6TH ST TO W MEHRING WY	ARREST MISD.	CHRYSLER	2006	OHIO	MALE	BLACK	18-25	P131	QUEENSGATE	QUEENSGATE	QUEENSGATE	
5610	33XX BURNET AV	CITATION TRAFFIC	CHRYSLER	2006	OHIO	FEMALE	BLACK	26-35	P431	AVONDALE	CORRYVILLE	CORRYVILLE	
5611	COLERAIN AV / HOFFNER ST	CITATION TRAFFIC	HONDA	2008	OHIO	MALE	BLACK	18-25	P531	NORTHSIDE	NORTHSIDE	NORTHSIDE	