City of Cincinnati Gender Study

Presentation for
EIYA Committee
by
UC Gender Equity Research Team
College of Arts & Sciences

Introduction: Study Overview

Two-year (2017-2019) mixed-method study which involves quantitative & qualitative elements.

Research informed by and extending beyond other Cities for CEDAW studies.

University of CINCINNATI

Quantitative Elements

- "Rough cut" analysis of gender and race breakdowns of City of Cincinnati employees per department and in appointments to boards & commissions, including gender wage gap(s), based on HR-provided data
- Determine 4-5 "deep-dive" departments (based on thematic criteria of health, economics, and safety; gender criteria of female-dominated, gender neutral, and male-dominated; and significant enough size)
- Conduct online surveys of employees in identified "deep dive" departments to refine demographic data/variable controls and determine job satisfaction and opportunities for advancement by gender (in combination with race)
- Conduct network analysis

Qualitative Elements

- "Rough cut" comparisons of department budgets and missions by gender make-up.
- "Deep-dive" departments research: textual analysis of missions, strategic plans, job announcements, etc.; gender-responsive budget analysis; and post-survey interviews of employees to further identify gender (in combination with race) bias in hiring, budgeting, and programming.
- Final focus groups within "deep dive" departments to encourage further self-study and recommended improvements.

Quantitative Analysis: Step 1

- Evaluate average pay differences between male and female employees *across all departments*
- Accounting for various factors
  - Job title
  - Education
  - Race
  - Full-time vs. part-time

Summary of Preliminary Findings

- Overall, on average, female employees make 10 cents less per hour than male employees.

- Overall, on average, black employees make 12 cents less per hour than white employees.

University of CINCINNATI

Quantitative Analysis: Step 2

- Establish percentage of male vs. female workers within each department

- Establish average pay differences between male and female workers within each department

- Evaluate average pay differences between male and female employees within each department *accounting for various factors*

Results

- Demographics
  - 11 of the 21 City Departments are at least 60% men.
  - 6 of the 21 City Departments are at least 60% women.
- Pay
  - Males make more in 16 of 21 City Departments
  - Controlling for other factors, male pay bias is found in 6 out of 21 City Departments
- Lessons
  - Men tend to be overrepresented
  - Men tend to make more on average, but this effect decreases when we adjust for job title, education, etc.
  - This variation leads us to believe that women tend to not be in higher paying positions.

Department Choices

- Thematic Criteria
  - Health, Economics, and Safety
- Gender Criteria
  - Female-Dominated, Neutral, and Male-Dominated
- Number of Employees
  - >75

Recommended Departments

Department	Prop. Male	Pay Gap: M-F	F/Pay relationship
PROPOSED "DEEP DIVE" DEPARTMENTS			
Health-Related			
Health Department	.16	9.86	Male Bias
Economics-Related			
Community & Econ. Dev.	.60	1.42	Female Bias
City Planning	.67	5.13	Neutral
Safety-Related			
Fire	.93	2.12	Male Bias
Police	.67	5.84	Female Bias

Survey Overview

- Conduct Initial Online Survey (early/mid-April 2018)
- Multiple Rounds
  - 2-3 times
- Demographic Variables
  - Age, race, gender, marriage status, sexuality, immigration status, children, veteran status, education, position, supervisor status, represented/non-represented/code status, etc.
- Network Variables
  - Friendship, leadership, advice
- Job Satisfaction Variables
  - Raises, happiness, perceived advancement opportunities, respect of co-workers, professionalism, etc.
- Perceptions of (Hetero)sexism and Racism in the US

Goals

- Demographic Models
  - Gender → Job Satisfaction
  - Race → Job Satisfaction
- Network Models
  - Gender → Networks → Job Satisfaction
  - Race → Networks → Job Satisfaction

Qualitative Analysis

- Limited to: Health, Community & Economic Development, City Planning and Police
- Preliminary Findings on
  - Boards and Commissions
    - Largely white, male, middle to upper class
  - Overall Budget
    - Operating Budget
      - Largely spent on personnel
      - Police & Fire=66%
    - Little mention of gender/race in budget priorities
    - Some data on CincyInsights disaggregated by gender & race (but no intersectional data)